UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA FEDERAL TRADE COMMISSION, Plaintiff, v. SL FINANCE LLC, a California limited liability company,
MICHAEL CASTILLO, individually
and as an officer of SL Finance LLC,
CHRISTIAN CASTILLO, individually
and as an officer of SL Finance LLC, Defendants. 

Case No. 8:23-cv-0698-JWH-ADS

ORDER ENTERING STIPULATED PRELIMINARY INJUNCTION

Plaintiff Federal Trade Commission (the "FTC") commenced this civil 1 2 action on April 24, 2023, pursuant to Sections 13(b) and 19 of the Federal Trade Commission Act (the "FTC Act"), 15 U.S.C. §§ 53(b) and 57b, the 3 Telemarketing and Consumer Fraud and Abuse Prevention Act (the 4 "Telemarketing Act"), 15 U.S.C. §§ 6101-6108, Section 1401(c) of the 5 COVID-19 Consumer Protection Act of the 2021 Consolidated Appropriations 6 Act, Pub. L. No. 116-260, 134 Stat. 1182, Div. FF, Title XIV, § 1401(c), 7 (Prohibiting Deceptive Acts or Practices in Connection With the Novel 8 Coronavirus) (the "COVID-19 Act"), and Section 522(a) of the Gramm-Leach-9 Bliley Act (the "GLB Act"), 15 U.S.C. § 6822(a). On motion by the FTC, this 10 Court entered an ex parte temporary restraining order ("TRO") on May 2, 11 2023, with an asset freeze, the appointment of a receiver, and other equitable 12 13 relief against Defendants. The FTC and Defendants SL Finance LLC, Michael Castillo, and Christian Castillo ("Stipulating Defendants"), by and through 14 their counsel, have stipulated and agreed to the entry of this preliminary *15* injunction order (the "Order"). 16

## I. FINDINGS OF FACT

By stipulation of the parties, the Court finds as follows:

*17* 

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

- A. The FTC and Stipulating Defendants have stipulated and agreed to entry of this Order without any admission of wrongdoing or violation of law, and without a finding by the Court of law or fact other than stated below.
- B. Stipulating Defendants waive all rights to seek judicial review or otherwise challenge or contest the validity of this Order.
- C. This Court has jurisdiction over the subject matter of this case, and there is good cause to believe that it will have jurisdiction over all parties hereto and that venue in this district is proper.
- D. The FTC asserts that there is good cause to believe that Stipulating Defendants have made material misrepresentations regarding their student loan

debt relief services, taken advance fees, engaged in illegal telemarketing, falsely promised that their student debt relief services are part of the Coronavirus Aid, Relief, and Economic Security Act (the "CARES Act") or some other COVID-19 relief program, and obtained customer information of a financial institution relating to another person by making false, fictitious, or fraudulent statements.

- E. The FTC asserts that there is good cause to believe that Stipulating Defendants have engaged in and are likely to engage in acts or practices that violate Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a), the Telemarketing Sales Rule (the "TSR"), 16 C.F.R. Part 310, Section 1401 of the COVID-19 Act, Pub. L. No. 116-260, 134 Stat. 1182, Title XIV, § 1401, and Section 521 of the GLB Act, 15 U.S.C. § 6821, and that the FTC is therefore likely to prevail on the merits of this action. As demonstrated by consumer declarations, consumer complaints, and the additional documentation filed by the FTC, the FTC asserts that it has established a likelihood of success in showing that, in numerous instances, Stipulating Defendants:
  - (1) have made deceptive representations in the marketing and sale of student debt relief services in violation of Section 5(a) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(a) and the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.3(a)(2)(x);
  - (2) have falsely represented to consumers that their debt relief services are part of the CARES Act or some other COVID-19 relief program created by the federal government in violation of COVID-19 Act, Pub L. No. 116-260, Title XIV, § 1401(b);
  - (3) have collected unlawful advance fees from consumers in violation of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(a)(5)(i);
  - (4) have engaged, or have caused a telemarketer to engage, in initiating an outbound telephone call to a person's telephone number on

the National Do Not Call Registry in violation of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B);

- (5) have initiated, or have caused others to initiate, an outbound telephone call to a telephone number within a given area code when Defendants had not, either directly or through another person, paid the required annual fee for access to telephone numbers within that area code that are included in the National Do Not Call Registry, in violation of the TSR, 16 C.F.R. § 310.8; and
- (6) have obtained customer information of a financial institution relating to another person by making false, fictitious, or fraudulent statements, in violation of Section 521 of the GLB Act, 15 U.S.C. § 6821.
- F. The FTC asserts that there is good cause to believe that Stipulating Defendants have taken in gross revenues of approximately \$5.9 million as a result of their unlawful practices.
- G. The FTC asserts that there is good cause to believe that immediate and irreparable harm will result from Stipulating Defendants' ongoing violations of the FTC Act, the TSR, the COVID-19 Act, and the GLB Act, unless Stipulating Defendants are restrained and enjoined by order of this Court.
- H. The FTC asserts that there is good cause to believe that immediate and irreparable damage to the Court's ability to grant effective final relief for consumers—including monetary restitution, rescission, disgorgement, or refunds—will occur from the sale, transfer, destruction, or other disposition or concealment by Stipulating Defendants of their assets or records, unless Stipulating Defendants are restrained and enjoined by order of this Court.
- I. The FTC asserts that good cause exists for continuing the receivership over the Receivership Entities, continuing the freeze imposed on Stipulated Defendants' assets pursuant to the TRO issued in this case, and continuing to permit the FTC and the Receiver to take expedited discovery.

*12* 

*23* 

- J. The FTC asserts that entry of this order is in the public interest.
- K. The FTC asserts that this Court has authority to issue this Order pursuant to Section 13(b) of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 53(b); Section 19 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. § 57b(b); Rule 65 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure; and the All Writs Act, 28 U.S.C. § 1651.
- L. No security is required of any agency of the United States for issuance of a preliminary injunction. Fed. R. Civ. P. 65(c).

## II. DEFINITIONS

For the purpose of this Order, the following definitions shall apply:

- A. "Asset" means any legal or equitable interest in, right to, or claim to, any property, wherever located and by whomever held.
  - B. "Assisting Others" includes:
  - (1) performing customer service functions, including receiving or responding to consumer complaints performing customer service functions, including receiving or responding to consumer complaints;
  - (2) formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any advertising or marketing material, including any telephone sales script, direct mail solicitation, or the design, text, or use of images of any Internet website, email, or other electronic communication;
  - (3) formulating or providing, or arranging for the formulation or provision of, any marketing support material or service, including web or Internet Protocol addresses or domain name registration for any Internet websites, affiliate marketing services, or media placement services;
  - (4) providing names of, or assisting in the generation of, potential customers;
  - (5) performing marketing, billing, payment processing, or payment services of any kind; or

- *2*

- *23*
- *26*

- (6) acting or serving as an owner, officer, director, manager, or principal of any entity.
- C. "Stipulating Corporate Defendant(s)" means SL Finance LLC, and each of its subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, and assigns.
- D. "Stipulating Defendant(s)" means Stipulating Corporate

  Defendants and Stipulating Individual Defendants individually, collectively, or in any combination.
- E. "Debt Relief Service" means any program or service represented, directly or by implication, to renegotiate, settle, or in any way alter the terms of payment or other terms of the debt between a person and one or more unsecured creditors or debt collectors, including, but not limited to, a reduction in the balance, interest rate, or fees owed by a person to an unsecured creditor or debt collector.
- F. "Document" is synonymous in meaning and equal in scope to the usage of "document" and "electronically stored information" in Rule 34(a), and includes writings, drawings, graphs, charts, photographs, sound and video recordings, images, Internet sites, web pages, websites, electronic correspondence, including e-mail and instant messages, contracts, accounting data, advertisements, FTP Logs, Server Access Logs, books, written or printed records, handwritten notes, telephone logs, telephone scripts, receipt books, ledgers, personal and business canceled checks and check registers, bank statements, appointment books, computer records, customer or sales databases and any other electronically stored information, including Documents located on remote servers or cloud computing systems, and other data or data compilations from which information can be obtained directly or, if necessary, after translation into a reasonably usable form. A draft or non-identical copy is a separate document within the meaning of the term.

- G. "Electronic Data Host" means any person or entity in the business of storing, hosting, or otherwise maintaining electronically stored information. This includes, but is not limited to, any entity hosting a website or server, and any entity providing "cloud based" electronic storage.
- H. "Established Business Relationship" means a relationship between the Seller and a person based on:
  - (1) the person's purchase, rental, or lease of the Seller's goods or services or a financial transaction between the person and Seller, within 18 months immediately preceding the date of the Telemarketing call; or
  - (2) the person's inquiry or application regarding a product or service offered by the Seller, within 3 months immediately preceding the date of a Telemarketing call.
- I. "Stipulating Individual Defendant(s)" means Michael Castillo and Christian Castillo, individually or jointly.
- J. "National Do Not Call Registry" means the "do-not-call" registry of telephone numbers maintained by the Commission pursuant to 16 C.F.R. § 310.4(b)(1)(iii)(B).
- K. "Outbound Telephone Call" means a telephone call initiated by a Telemarketer to induce the purchase of goods or services or to solicit a charitable contribution.
- L. "Receiver" means the receiver appointed in Section III.13 of this Order and any deputy receivers that shall be named by the receiver.
- M. "Receivership Entities" means Stipulating Corporate Defendants as well as any other entity that has conducted any business related to Stipulating Defendants' marketing of Debt Relief Services, including receipt of Assets derived from any activity that is the subject of the Complaint in this matter, and that the Receiver determines is controlled or owned by any Stipulating Defendant.

*13* 

*24* 

*27* 

- N. "Seller" means any person who, in connection with a Telemarketing transaction, provides, offers to provide, or arranges for others to provide goods or services to the customer in exchange for consideration.
- O. "Telemarketer" means any person who, in connection with telemarketing, initiates or receives telephone calls to or from a customer or donor. 16 C.F.R. § 310.2(cc).
- P. "Telemarketing" means a plan, program, or campaign (whether or not covered by the TSR, 16 C.F.R. Part 310) that is conducted to induce the purchase of goods or services or a charitable contribution by use of one or more telephones.

## III. ORDER

It is hereby **ORDERED** as follows:

- 1. Prohibition on Deceptive Representations. Stipulating Defendants, Stipulating Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with them, who receive actual notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, whether acting directly or indirectly, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promoting, or offering for sale of any goods or services, are **RESTRAINED** and **ENJOINED** from:
  - a. Misrepresenting, or Assisting Others in misrepresenting, expressly or by implication, any material fact, including, but not limited to:
    - i. that consumers who pay for Stipulating Defendant's program will be enrolled in a loan repayment program and have their loan balances forgiven in whole or in part;
    - ii. that most or all of consumers' monthly payments to Stipulating Defendants will be applied to their loan balances;
    - iii. that Stipulating Defendants are contracted by, or otherwise affiliated with, the Department of Education;

8 9

10 11

12 13

14

15

16

*17* 18

19

20

21

22 23

24

25 26

27

- that Stipulating Defendants will assume responsibility iv. for the servicing of consumers' student loans; and
- any other fact material to consumers concerning any v. good or service, such as: the total costs; any material restrictions, limitations, or conditions; or any material aspect of its performance, efficacy, nature, or central characteristics; and
- making, or Assisting Others in making, any representation, expressly or by implication, about the benefits, performance, or efficacy of any product or service, unless the representation is non-misleading and, at the time such representation is made, Stipulating Defendants possess and rely upon competent and reliable evidence that is sufficient in quality and quantity based on standards generally accepted in the relevant fields, when considered in light of the entire body of relevant and reliable evidence, to substantiate that the representation is true.
- Prohibition on Collection of Advance Fees. Stipulating Defendants, and their officers, agents, employees, and those persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby **RESTRAINED** and ENJOINED from providing, offering to provide, or arranging for others to provide any Debt Relief Service and requesting or receiving payment of any fees or consideration for any Debt Relief Service, until and unless:
  - the seller or telemarketer has renegotiated, settled, reduced, or otherwise altered the terms of at least one debt pursuant to a settlement agreement, debt management plan, or other such valid contractual agreement executed by the customer;
  - the customer has made at least one payment pursuant to that b. settlement agreement, debt management plan, or other valid contractual agreement between the customer and the creditor or debt collector; and

*21* 

- c. to the extent that debts enrolled in a service are renegotiated, settled, reduced, or otherwise altered individually, the fee or consideration either:
  - i. bears the same proportional relationship to the total fee for renegotiating, settling, reducing, or altering the terms of the entire debt balance as the individual debt amount bears to the entire debt amount. The individual debt amount and the entire debt amount are those owed at the time the debt was enrolled in the service; or
  - ii. is a percentage of the amount saved as a result of the renegotiation, settlement, reduction, or alteration. The percentage charged cannot change from one individual debt to another. The amount saved is the difference between the amount owed at the time the debt was enrolled in the service and the amount actually paid to satisfy the debt.
- 3. Telemarketing. Stipulating Defendants and their officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and those persons or entities in active concert or participation with any of them who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly, in connection with the advertising, marketing, promotion, offering for sale, sale, or provision of any good or service, are hereby **RESTRAINED** and **ENJOINED** from engaging in any of the following practices:
  - a. Initiating or causing others to initiate any Outbound
    Telephone Call to any person at a telephone number on the National Do
    Not Call Registry, unless:
    - i. Stipulating Defendants have obtained the express
       agreement, in writing, of such person to place calls to that person.
       Such written agreement shall clearly evidence such person's

authorization that calls made by or on behalf of Stipulating Defendants may be placed to that person, and shall include the telephone number to which the calls may be placed and the signature of that person; or

- ii. Stipulating Defendants have an Established Business Relationship with such person, and that person has not previously stated that he or she does not wish to receive Outbound Telephone Calls made by or on behalf of Stipulating Defendants;
- b. Initiating or causing others to initiate any Outbound
  Telephone Call to a telephone number within a given area code when the
  annual fee for access to the telephone numbers within that area code that
  are on the National Do Not Call Registry has not been paid by or on behalf
  of Stipulating Defendants, unless the telephone call is:
  - i. A solicitation to induce charitable contributions;
  - ii. To a business;
  - iii. To persons who have given the Seller their express agreement, in writing and signed, to receive calls from Stipulating Defendants; or
  - iv. To persons who have an Established Business Relationship with Stipulating Defendants.
- 4. Prohibition on Release of Customer Information. Stipulating Defendants, Stipulating Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby **RESTRAINED** and **ENJOINED** from:
  - a. Selling, renting, leasing, transferring, or otherwise disclosing, the name, address, birth date, telephone number, email address, credit card number, bank account number, Social Security number, or other

*23* 

 financial or identifying information of any person that any Stipulating Defendant obtained in connection with any activity that pertains to the subject matter of this Order; and

b. Benefitting from or using the name, address, birth date, telephone number, email address, credit card number, bank account number, Social Security number, or other financial or identifying information of any person that any Stipulating Defendant obtained in connection with any activity that pertains to the subject matter of this Order.

Provided, however, that Stipulating Defendants may disclose such identifying information to a law enforcement agency, to their attorneys as required for their defense, as required by any law, regulation, or court order, or in any filings, pleadings, or discovery in this action in the manner required by the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and by any protective order in the case.

- 5. <u>Asset Freeze</u>. Stipulating Defendants and their officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby **RESTRAINED** and **ENJOINED** from:
  - a. Transferring, liquidating, converting, encumbering, pledging, loaning, selling, concealing, dissipating, disbursing, assigning, relinquishing, spending, withdrawing, granting a lien or security interest or other interest in, or otherwise disposing of any Assets that are:
    - i. owned or controlled, directly or indirectly, by any
       Stipulating Defendant;
    - ii. held, in part or in whole, for the benefit of anyStipulating Defendant;
    - iii. in the actual or constructive possession of anyStipulating Defendant; or

- iv. owned or controlled by, in the actual or constructive possession of, or otherwise held for the benefit of, any corporation, partnership, asset protection trust, or other entity that is directly or indirectly owned, managed, or controlled by any Stipulating Defendant.
- b. Opening or causing to be opened any safe deposit boxes, commercial mailboxes, or storage facilities titled in the name of any Stipulating Defendant or subject to access by any Stipulating Defendant, except as necessary to comply with written requests from the Receiver acting pursuant to its authority under this Order;
- c. Incurring charges or cash advances on any credit, debit, or ATM card issued in the name, individually or jointly, of any Stipulating Corporate Defendant or any corporation, partnership, or other entity directly or indirectly owned, managed, or controlled by any Stipulating Defendant or of which any Stipulating Defendant is an officer, director, member, or manager. This includes any corporate bankcard or corporate credit card account for which any Stipulating Defendant is, or was on the date that this Order was signed, an authorized signor; or
- d. Cashing any checks or depositing any money orders or cash received from consumers, clients, or customers of any Stipulating Defendant. The Assets affected by this Section shall include:
  - i. all Assets of Stipulating Defendants as of the time this
     Order is entered; and
  - ii. Assets obtained by Stipulating Defendants after this Order is entered if those Assets are derived from any activity that is the subject of the Complaint in this matter or that is prohibited by this Order.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

*10* 

11

12

13

14

*15* 

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

This Section does not prohibit any transfers to the Receiver or repatriation of foreign Assets specifically required by this order. Provided, however, that by no later than May 31, 2023, Stipulating Defendants may make a one-time withdrawal of up to \$6,554 from Stipulating Defendant Christian Castillo's individual bank account ending in 3848 at Bank of America, reflecting an allowance for housing and personal living expenses for Christian Castillo in the amount of \$2,681 and an allowance for housing and personal living expenses for Michael Castillo in the amount of \$3,873.

Duties of Asset Holders and Other Third Parties. Any financial or 6. brokerage institution, Electronic Data Host, credit card processor, payment processor, merchant bank, acquiring bank, independent sales organization, third party processor, payment gateway, insurance company, business entity, or person who receives actual notice of this Order (by service or otherwise) that (1) has held, controlled, or maintained custody, through an account or otherwise, of any Stipulating Document on behalf of any Stipulating Defendant or any Asset that has been owned or controlled, directly or indirectly, by any Stipulating Defendant; held, in part or in whole, for the benefit of any Stipulating Defendant; in the actual or constructive possession of any Stipulating Defendant; or owned or controlled by, in the actual or constructive possession of, or otherwise held for the benefit of, any corporation, partnership, asset protection trust, or other entity that is directly or indirectly owned, managed or controlled by any Stipulating Defendant; (2) has held, controlled, or maintained custody, through an account or otherwise, of any Document or Asset associated with credits, debits, or charges made on behalf of any Stipulating Defendant, including reserve funds held by payment processors, credit card processors, merchant banks, acquiring banks, independent sales organizations, third party processors, payment gateways, insurance companies, or other

entities; or (3) has extended credit to any Stipulating Defendant, including through a credit card account, shall:

- a. Hold, preserve, and retain within its control and prohibit the withdrawal, removal, alteration, assignment, transfer, pledge, encumbrance, disbursement, dissipation, relinquishment, conversion, sale, or other disposal of any such Document or Asset, as well as all Documents or other property related to such Assets, except by further order of this Court; provided, however, that this provision does not prohibit an Stipulating Individual Defendant from incurring charges on a personal credit card established prior to entry of this Order, up to the preexisting credit limit;
- b. Deny any person, except the Receiver, access to any safe deposit box, commercial mailbox, or storage facility that is titled in the name of any Stipulating Defendant, either individually or jointly, or otherwise subject to access by any Stipulating Defendant;
- c. Provide the FTC's counsel and the Receiver, within three (3) days of receiving a copy of this Order, a sworn statement setting forth, for each Asset or account covered by this Section:
  - i. The identification number of each such account or Asset;
  - ii. The balance of each such account, or a description of the nature and value of each such Asset as of the close of business on the day on which this Order is served, and, if the account or other Asset has been closed or removed, the date closed or removed, the total funds removed in order to close the account, and the name of the person or entity to whom such account or other Asset was remitted; and

- iii. The identification of any safe deposit box, commercial mailbox, or storage facility that is either titled in the name, individually or jointly, of any Stipulating Defendant, or is otherwise subject to access by any Stipulating Defendant; and
- d. Upon the request of the FTC's counsel or the Receiver, promptly provide the FTC's counsel and the Receiver with copies of all records or other Documents pertaining to any account covered by this Section or Asset, including originals or copies of account applications, account statements, signature cards, checks, drafts, deposit tickets, transfers to and from the accounts, including wire transfers and wire transfer instructions, all other debit and credit instruments or slips, currency transaction reports, 1099 forms, and all logs and records pertaining to safe deposit boxes, commercial mail boxes, and storage facilities.

Provided, however, that this Section does not prohibit any transfers to the Receiver or repatriation of foreign Assets specifically required by this order.

- 7. <u>Financial Disclosures</u>. Stipulating Defendant, to the extent they have not each done so pursuant to the TRO, within three (3) days of service of this Order upon them, shall prepare and deliver to the FTC's counsel and the Receiver:
  - a. completed financial statements on the forms attached to this Order as Attachment A (Financial Statement of Individual Defendant) for each Stipulating Individual Defendant, and Attachment B (Financial Statement of Corporate Defendant) for each Stipulating Corporate Defendant; and
  - b. completed Attachment C (IRS Form 4506, Request for Copy of a Tax Return) for each Stipulating Individual and Corporate Defendant.

- 8. <u>Foreign Asset Repatriation</u>. To the extent not already done pursuant to the TRO, within five (5) days following the service of this Order, each Stipulating Defendant shall:
  - a. Provide the FTC's counsel and the Receiver with a full accounting, verified under oath and accurate as of the date of this Order, of all Assets, Documents, and accounts outside of the United States which are:
    - i. titled in the name, individually or jointly, of any
       Stipulating Defendant;
    - ii. held by any person or entity for the benefit of any
      Stipulating Defendant or for the benefit of, any corporation,
      partnership, asset protection trust, or other entity that is directly or
      indirectly owned, managed, or controlled by any Stipulating
      Defendant; or
    - iii. under the direct or indirect control, whether jointly or singly, of any Stipulating Defendant;
  - b. Take all steps necessary to provide the FTC's counsel and Receiver access to all Documents and records that may be held by third parties located outside of the territorial United States of America, including signing the Consent to Release of Financial Records appended to this Order as Attachment D.
  - c. Transfer to the territory of the United States all Documents and Assets located in foreign countries which are:
    - i. titled in the name, individually or jointly, of any
       Stipulating Defendant;
    - ii. held by any person or entity for the benefit of any Stipulating Defendant or for the benefit of, any corporation, partnership, asset protection trust, or other entity that is directly or

indirectly owned, managed, or controlled by any Stipulating Defendant; or

- iii. under the direct or indirect control, whether jointly or singly, of any Stipulating Defendant; and
- d. The same business day as any repatriation,
- i. notify the Receiver and counsel for the FTC of the name and location of the financial institution or other entity that is the recipient of such Documents or Assets; and
- ii. serve this Order on any such financial institution or other entity.
- 9. Non-Interference with Repatriation. Stipulating Defendants,
  Stipulating Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other
  persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual
  notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby

  RESTRAINED and ENJOINED from taking any action, directly or indirectly,
  which may result in the encumbrance or dissipation of foreign Assets, or in the
  hindrance of the repatriation required by this Order, including, but not limited
  to:
  - a. Sending any communication or engaging in any other act, directly or indirectly, that results in a determination by a foreign trustee or other entity that a "duress" event has occurred under the terms of a foreign trust agreement until such time that all Stipulating Defendants' Assets have been fully repatriated pursuant to this Order; or
  - b. Notifying any trustee, protector or other agent of any foreign trust or other related entities of either the existence of this Order, or of the fact that repatriation is required pursuant to a court order, until such time that all Stipulating Defendants' Assets have been fully repatriated pursuant to this Order.

*22* 

- 10. <u>Consumer Credit Reports</u>. The FTC may obtain credit reports concerning any Stipulating Defendants pursuant to Section 604(a)(1) of the Fair Credit Reporting Act, 15 U.S.C. § 1681b(a)(1), and that, upon written request, any credit reporting agency from which such reports are requested shall provide them to the FTC.
- 11. <u>Preservation of Records</u>. Stipulating Defendants, Stipulating Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby **RESTRAINED** and **ENJOINED** from:
  - a. Destroying, erasing, falsifying, writing over, mutilating, concealing, altering, transferring, or otherwise disposing of, in any manner, directly or indirectly, Documents that relate to:
    - i. the business, business practices, Assets, or business or personal finances of any Stipulating Defendant;
    - ii. the business practices or finances of entities directly or indirectly under the control of any Stipulating Defendant; or
    - iii. the business practices or finances of entities directly or indirectly under common control with any other StipulatingDefendant; and
  - b. Failing to create and maintain Documents that, in reasonable detail, accurately, fairly, and completely reflect Stipulating Defendants' incomes, disbursements, transactions, and use of Stipulating Defendants' Assets.
- 12. Report of New Business Activity. Stipulating Defendants,
  Stipulating Defendants' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, and all other
  persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual
  notice of this Order, whether acting directly or indirectly, are hereby

**RESTRAINED** and **ENJOINED** from creating, operating, or exercising any control over any business entity, whether newly formed or previously inactive, including any partnership, limited partnership, joint venture, sole proprietorship, or corporation, without first providing the FTC's counsel and the Receiver with a written statement disclosing:

- a. the name of the business entity;
- b. the address and telephone number of the business entity;
- c. the names of the business entity's officers, directors, principals, managers, and employees; and
- d. a detailed description of the business entity's intended activities.
- 13. Receiver. Thomas W. McNamara shall continue to serve as Receiver of the Receivership Entities with full powers of an equity receiver. The Receiver shall be solely the agent of this Court in acting as Receiver under this Order.
- 14. <u>Duties and Authorities of Receiver</u>. The Receiver is directed and authorized to accomplish the following:
  - a. Assume full control of Receivership Entities by removing, as the Receiver deems necessary or advisable, any director, officer, independent contractor, employee, attorney, or agent of any Receivership Entity from control of, management of, or participation in, the affairs of the Receivership Entity;
  - b. Take exclusive custody, control, and possession of all Assets and Documents of, or in the possession, custody, or under the control of, any Receivership Entity, wherever situated;
  - c. Take exclusive custody, control, and possession of all Documents or Assets associated with credits, debits, or charges made on behalf of any Receivership Entity, wherever situated, including reserve

*23* 

funds held by payment processors, credit card processors, merchant banks, acquiring banks, independent sales organizations, third party processors, payment gateways, insurance companies, or other entities;

- d. Conserve, hold, manage, and prevent the loss of all Assets of the Receivership Entities, and perform all acts necessary or advisable to preserve the value of those Assets. The Receiver shall assume control over the income and profits therefrom and all sums of money now or hereafter due or owing to the Receivership Entities. The Receiver shall have full power to sue for, collect, and receive, all Assets of the Receivership Entities and of other persons or entities whose interests are now under the direction, possession, custody, or control of, the Receivership Entities. Provided, however, that the Receiver shall not attempt to collect any amount from a consumer if the Receiver believes the consumer's debt to the Receivership Entities has resulted from the deceptive acts or practices or other violations of law alleged in the Complaint in this matter, without prior Court approval;
- e. Obtain, conserve, hold, manage, and prevent the loss of all Documents of the Receivership Entities, and perform all acts necessary or advisable to preserve such Documents. The Receiver shall: divert mail; preserve all Documents of the Receivership Entities that are accessible via electronic means (such as online access to financial accounts and access to electronic documents held onsite or by Electronic Data Hosts, by changing usernames, passwords or other log-in credentials; take possession of all electronic Documents of the Receivership Entities stored onsite or remotely; take whatever steps necessary to preserve all such Documents; and obtain the assistance of the FTC's Digital Forensic Unit for the purpose of obtaining electronic documents stored onsite or remotely.

- f. Choose, engage, and employ attorneys, accountants, appraisers, and other independent contractors and technical specialists, as the Receiver deems advisable or necessary in the performance of duties and responsibilities under the authority granted by this Order;
- g. Make payments and disbursements from the receivership estate that are necessary or advisable for carrying out the directions of, or exercising the authority granted by, this Order, and to incur, or authorize the making of, such agreements as may be necessary and advisable in discharging his or her duties as Receiver. The Receiver shall apply to the Court for prior approval of any payment of any debt or obligation incurred by the Receivership Entities prior to the date of entry of this Order, except payments that the Receiver deems necessary or advisable to secure Assets of the Receivership Entities, such as rental payments;
- h. Take all steps necessary to secure and take exclusive custody of each location from which the Receivership Entities operate their businesses. Such steps may include, but are not limited to, any of the following, as the Receiver deems necessary or advisable:
  - i. securing the location by changing the locks and alarm codes and disconnecting any internet access or other means of access to the computers, servers, internal networks, or other records maintained at that location; and
  - ii. requiring any persons present at the location to leave the premises, to provide the Receiver with proof of identification, and/or to demonstrate to the satisfaction of the Receiver that such persons are not removing from the premises Documents or Assets of the Receivership Entities. Law enforcement personnel, including, but not limited to, police or sheriffs, may assist the Receiver in implementing these provisions in order to keep the

 peace and maintain security. If requested by the Receiver, the United States Marshal will provide appropriate and necessary assistance to the Receiver to implement this Order and is authorized to use any necessary and reasonable force to do so;

- i. Take all steps necessary to prevent the modification, destruction, or erasure of any web page or website registered to and operated, in whole or in part, by any Stipulating Defendants, and to provide access to all such web page or websites to the FTC's representatives, agents, and assistants, as well as Stipulating Defendants and their representatives;
- j. Enter into and cancel contracts and purchase insurance as advisable or necessary;
- k. Prevent the inequitable distribution of Assets and determine, adjust, and protect the interests of consumers who have transacted business with the Receivership Entities;
- l. Make an accounting, as soon as practicable, of the Assets and financial condition of the receivership and file the accounting with the Court and deliver copies thereof to all parties;
- m. Institute, compromise, adjust, appear in, intervene in, defend, dispose of, or otherwise become party to any legal action in state, federal or foreign courts or arbitration proceedings as the Receiver deems necessary and advisable to preserve or recover the Assets of the Receivership Entities, or to carry out the Receiver's mandate under this Order, including but not limited to, actions challenging fraudulent or voidable transfers;
- n. Issue subpoenas to obtain Documents and records pertaining to the Receivership, and conduct discovery in this action on behalf of the

*13* 

*24* 

receivership estate, in addition to obtaining other discovery as set forth in this Order;

- o. Open one or more bank accounts at designated depositories for funds of the Receivership Entities. The Receiver shall deposit all funds of the Receivership Entities in such designated accounts and shall make all payments and disbursements from the receivership estate from such accounts. The Receiver shall serve copies of monthly account statements on all parties;
- p. Maintain accurate records of all receipts and expenditures incurred as Receiver;
- q. Allow the FTC's representatives, agents, and assistants, as well as Stipulating Defendants' representatives and Stipulating Defendants themselves, reasonable access to the premises of the Receivership Entities, or any other premises where the Receivership Entities conduct business. The purpose of this access shall be to inspect and copy any and all books, records, Documents, accounts, and other property owned by, or in the possession of, the Receivership Entities or their agents. The Receiver shall have the discretion to determine the time, manner, and reasonable conditions of such access;
- r. Allow the FTC's representatives, agents, and assistants, as well as Stipulating Defendants and their representatives reasonable access to all Documents in the possession, custody, or control of the Receivership Entities;
- s. Cooperate with reasonable requests for information or assistance from any state or federal civil or criminal law enforcement agency;

*5* 

- t. Suspend business operations of the Receivership Entities if in the judgment of the Receiver such operations cannot be continued legally and profitably;
- u. If the Receiver identifies a nonparty entity as a Receivership Entity, promptly notify the entity as well as the parties, and inform the entity that it can challenge the Receiver's determination by filing a motion with the Court. Provided, however, that the Receiver may delay providing such notice until the Receiver has established control of the nonparty entity and its assets and records, if the Receiver determines that notice to the entity or the parties before the Receiver establishes control over the entity may result in the destruction of records, dissipation of assets, or any other obstruction of the Receiver's control of the entity; and
- v. If in the Receiver's judgment the business operations cannot be continued legally and profitably, take all steps necessary to ensure that any of the Receivership Entities' web pages or websites relating to the activities alleged in the Complaint cannot be accessed by the public, or are modified for consumer education and/or informational purposes, and take all steps necessary to ensure that any telephone numbers associated with the Receivership Entities cannot be accessed by the public, or are answered solely to provide consumer education or information regarding the status of operations.
- 15. Transfer of Receivership Property to Receiver. To the extent not already done so pursuant to the TRO, Stipulating Defendants and any other person, with possession, custody or control of property of, or records relating to, the Receivership Entities shall, upon notice of this Order by personal service or otherwise, fully cooperate with and assist the Receiver in taking and maintaining possession, custody, or control of the Assets and Documents of the Receivership

Entities and immediately transfer or deliver to the Receiver possession, custody, and control of, the following:

- a. All Assets held by or for the benefit of the Receivership Entities;
- b. All Documents or Assets associated with credits, debits, or charges made on behalf of any Receivership Entity, wherever situated, including reserve funds held by payment processors, credit card processors, merchant banks, acquiring banks, independent sales organizations, third party processors, payment gateways, insurance companies, or other entities;
  - c. All Documents of or pertaining to the Receivership Entities;
- d. All computers, electronic devices, mobile devices, and machines used to conduct the business of the Receivership Entities;
- e. All Assets and Documents belonging to other persons or entities whose interests are under the direction, possession, custody, or control of the Receivership Entities; and
- f. All keys, codes, usernames, and passwords necessary to gain or to secure access to any Assets or Documents of or pertaining to the Receivership Entities, including access to their business premises, means of communication, accounts, computer systems (onsite and remote), Electronic Data Hosts, or other property.

In the event that any person or entity fails to deliver or transfer any Asset or Document, or otherwise fails to comply with any provision of this Section, the Receiver may file an Affidavit of Non-Compliance regarding the failure and a motion seeking compliance or a contempt citation.

16. <u>Provision of Information to Receiver</u>. To the extent not already done so pursuant to the TRO, Stipulating Defendants shall immediately provide to the Receiver:

- 1 2 3
- *4 5*
- 7

- 9 10
- 11
- *12 13*
- 14
- 15 16
- 17
- 18
- 19
- 20
- *21 22*
- 23
- 24 25
- 26
- 27 28

- a. A list of all Assets and accounts of the Receivership Entities that are held in any name other than the name of a Receivership Entity, or by any person or entity other than a Receivership Entity;
- b. A list of all agents, employees, officers, attorneys, servants and those persons in active concert and participation with the Receivership Entities, or who have been associated or done business with the Receivership Entities; and
- c. A description of any documents covered by attorney-client privilege or attorney work product, including files where such documents are likely to be located, authors or recipients of such documents, and search terms likely to identify such electronic documents.
- Cooperation with the Receiver. Stipulating Defendants; 17. Receivership Entities; Stipulating Defendants' or Receivership Entities' officers, agents, employees, and attorneys, all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, and any other person with possession, custody, or control of property of or records relating to the Receivership entities who receive actual notice of this Order shall fully cooperate with and assist the Receiver. This cooperation and assistance shall include, but is not limited to, providing information to the Receiver that the Receiver deems necessary to exercise the authority and discharge the responsibilities of the Receiver under this Order; providing any keys, codes, user names and passwords required to access any computers, electronic devices, mobile devices, and machines (onsite or remotely) and any cloud account (including specific method to access account) or electronic file in any medium; advising all persons who owe money to any Receivership Entity that all debts should be paid directly to the Receiver; and transferring funds at the Receiver's direction and producing records related to the Assets and sales of the Receivership Entities.

*22* 

*27* 

- 18. Non-Interference With the Receiver. Stipulating Defendants; Receivership Entities; Stipulating Defendants' or Receivership Entities' officers, agents, employees, attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, and any other person served with a copy of this Order, are hereby **RESTRAINED** and **ENJOINED** from directly or indirectly:
  - a. Interfering with the Receiver's efforts to manage, or take custody, control, or possession of, the Assets or Documents subject to the receivership;
    - b. Transacting any of the business of the Receivership Entities;
  - c. Transferring, receiving, altering, selling, encumbering, pledging, assigning, liquidating, or otherwise disposing of any Assets owned, controlled, or in the possession or custody of, or in which an interest is held or claimed by, the Receivership Entities; or
  - d. Refusing to cooperate with the Receiver or the Receiver's duly authorized agents in the exercise of their duties or authority under any order of this Court.
- 19. Stay of Actions. Except by leave of this Court, during the pendency of the receivership ordered herein, Stipulating Defendants, Stipulating Defendants' officers, agents, employees, attorneys, and all other persons in active concert or participation with any of them, who receive actual notice of this Order, and their corporations, subsidiaries, divisions, or affiliates, and all investors, creditors, stockholders, lessors, customers and other persons seeking to establish or enforce any claim, right, or interest against or on behalf of Stipulating Defendants, and all others acting for or on behalf of such persons, are hereby enjoined from taking action that would interfere with the exclusive jurisdiction of this Court over the Assets or Documents of the Receivership Entities, including, but not limited to:

- a. Filing or assisting in the filing of a petition for relief under the Bankruptcy Code, 11 U.S.C. §§ 101 *et seq.*, or of any similar insolvency proceeding on behalf of the Receivership Entities;
- b. Commencing, prosecuting, or continuing a judicial, administrative, or other action or proceeding against the Receivership Entities, including the issuance or employment of process against the Receivership Entities, except that such actions may be commenced if necessary to toll any applicable statute of limitations;
- c. Filing or enforcing any lien on any asset of the Receivership Entities, taking, or attempting to take possession, custody, or control of any Asset of the Receivership Entities; or attempting to foreclose, forfeit, alter, or terminate any interest in any Asset of the Receivership Entities, whether such acts are part of a judicial proceeding, are acts of self-help, or otherwise.

Provided, however, that this Order does not stay: (1) the commencement or continuation of a criminal action or proceeding; (2) the commencement or continuation of an action or proceeding by a governmental unit to enforce such governmental unit's police or regulatory power; or (3) the enforcement of a judgment, other than a money judgment, obtained in an action or proceeding by a governmental unit to enforce such governmental unit's police or regulatory power.

20. Compensation of Receiver. The Receiver and all personnel hired by the Receiver as herein authorized, including counsel to the Receiver and accountants, are entitled to reasonable compensation for the performance of duties pursuant to this Order and for the cost of actual out-of-pocket expenses incurred by them, from the Assets now held by, in the possession or control of, or which may be received by, the Receivership Entities. The Receiver shall file with the Court and serve on the parties periodic requests for the payment of

*3* 

5

6

7

8

9 10

11 12

13 14

*15* 

16 17

18

19

20

21

*22 23* 

24

25

26

*27* 

28

such reasonable compensation, with the first such request filed no more than sixty (60) days after the date of entry of this Order. The Receiver shall not increase the hourly rates used as the bases for such fee applications without prior approval of the Court.

- 21. Receiver's Bond. The bond in the sum of \$15,000 previously filed by the Receiver with the Clerk of this Court shall remain in effect, conditioned that the Receiver will well and truly perform the duties of the office and abide by and perform all acts the Court directs. 28 U.S.C. § 754.
- Distribution of Order by Stipulating Defendants. Stipulating 22. Defendants shall immediately provide a copy of this Order to each affiliate, telemarketer, marketer, sales entity, successor, assign, member, officer, director, employee, agent, independent contractor, client, attorney, spouse, subsidiary, division, and representative of any Stipulating Defendant, and shall, to the extent not already done so pursuant to the TRO, within three (3) days from the date of entry of this Order, and provide the FTC and the Receiver with a sworn statement that this provision of the Order has been satisfied, which statement shall include the names, physical addresses, phone number, and email addresses of each such person or entity who received a copy of the Order. Furthermore, Stipulating Defendants shall not take any action that would encourage officers, agents, members, directors, employees, salespersons, independent contractors, attorneys, subsidiaries, affiliates, successors, assigns or other persons or entities in active concert or participation with them to disregard this Order or believe that they are not bound by its provisions.
- 23. Expedited Discovery. Notwithstanding the provisions of the Rule 26(d) and (f) and 30(a)(2)(A)(iii), and pursuant to Rule 30(a), 33, 34, and 45, the FTC and the Receiver are granted leave, at any time after service of this Order, to conduct limited expedited discovery for the purpose of discovering: (1) the nature, location, status, and extent of Stipulating Defendants' Assets;

- (2) the nature, location, and extent of Stipulating Defendants' business transactions and operations; (3) Documents reflecting Stipulating Defendants' business transactions and operations; or (4) compliance with this Order. The limited expedited discovery set forth in this Section shall proceed as follows:
  - a. The FTC and the Receiver may take the deposition of parties and non-parties. Forty-eight (48) hours' notice shall be sufficient notice for such depositions. The limitations and conditions set forth in Rules 30(a)(2)(A) and 31(a)(2)(A) regarding subsequent depositions of an individual shall not apply to depositions taken pursuant to this Section. Any such deposition taken pursuant to this Section shall not be counted towards the deposition limit set forth in Rules 30(a)(2)(A) and 31(a)(2)(A) and depositions may be taken by telephone or other remote electronic means;
  - b. The FTC and the Receiver may serve upon parties requests for production of Documents or inspection that require production or inspection within five (5) days of service, provided, however, that three (3) days of notice shall be deemed sufficient for the production of any such Documents that are maintained or stored only in an electronic format;
  - c. The FTC and the Receiver may serve upon parties interrogatories that require response within five (5) days after the FTC serves such interrogatories;
  - d. The FTC and the Receiver may serve subpoenas upon nonparties that direct production or inspection within five (5) days of service;
  - e. Service of discovery upon a party to this action, taken pursuant to this Section, shall be sufficient if made by facsimile, email, or by overnight delivery;

- f. Any expedited discovery taken pursuant to this Section is in addition to, and is not subject to, the limits on discovery set forth in the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure and the Local Rules of this Court. The expedited discovery permitted by this Section does not require a meeting or conference of the parties, pursuant to Rules 26(d) & (f);
- g. The Parties are exempted from making initial disclosures under Rule 26(a)(1) until further order of this Court.
- 24. Service of this Order. Copies of this Order may be served by any means, including facsimile transmission, electronic mail or other electronic messaging, personal or overnight delivery, U.S. Mail or FedEx, by agents and employees of the FTC, by any law enforcement agency, or by private process server, upon any Stipulating Defendant or any person (including any financial institution) that may have possession, custody or control of any Asset or Document of any Stipulating Defendant, or that may be subject to any provision of this Order pursuant to Rule 65(d)(2). For purposes of this Section, service upon any branch, subsidiary, affiliate, or office of any entity shall effect service upon the entire entity.
- 25. <u>Correspondence and Service on the FTC</u>. For the purpose of this Order, all correspondence and service of pleadings on the FTC shall be addressed to the FTC's counsel of record.
- 26. <u>Duration of the Order</u>. This Order shall expire upon entry of a final judgment in this case.
- 27. <u>Retention of Jurisdiction</u>. This Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for all purposes.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: May 22, 2023

UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE